

(Stipulating Parties Listed on Signature Pages)

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
(SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION)

IN RE: CATHODE RAY TUBE (CRT)
ANTITRUST LITIGATION

Case No. 07-5944 SC
MDL No. 1917

This Document Relates to:

Electrograph Systems, Inc., et al. v. Hitachi, Ltd., et al., No. 11-cv-01656;

Stoebner, et al. v. LG Electronics, et al., No. 11-cv-05381;

Siegel v. Hitachi, Ltd., et al., No. 11-cv-05502;

Best Buy Co., Inc., et al. v. Hitachi, Ltd., et al., No. 11-cv-05513;

Target Corp, et al. v. Chunghwa Picture Tubes, Ltd., et al., No. 11-cv-05514;

Interbond Corporation of America v. Hitachi, et al., No. 11-cv-06275;

Office Depot, Inc. v. Hitachi Ltd., et al., No. 11-cv-06276;

CompuCom Systems, Inc. v. Hitachi, Ltd., et al., No. 11-cv-06396;

Costco Wholesale Corporation v. Hitachi, Ltd., et al., No. 11-cv-06397;

P.C. Richard & Son Long Island Corporation, et al., v. Hitachi, Ltd., et al., No. 12-cv-02648;

Schultze Agency Services, LLC, et al. v. Hitachi, Ltd., et al., No. 12-cv-02649.

**STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED]
ORDER REGARDING PAGE LIMITS
OF OBJECTIONS TO AND MOTIONS
TO ADOPT SPECIAL MASTER'S MAY
2, 2013 REPORT AND
RECOMMENDATION ON MOTIONS
TO DISMISS DIRECT ACTION
COMPLAINTS**

STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED] ORDER
REGARDING PAGE LIMITS OF OBJECTIONS
TO AND MOTIONS TO ADOPT SPECIAL
MASTER'S MAY 2, 2013 REPORT AND
RECOMMENDATION ON MOTIONS TO
DISMISS DIRECT ACTION COMPLAINTS

Case No. 07-5944
MDL NO. 1917

1 WHEREAS, on August 17, 2012, the undersigned Defendants jointly moved to dismiss
2 various claims asserted in the complaints filed by Direct Action Plaintiffs (“DAPs”) (Dkt. Nos.
3 1317 & 1318);

4 WHEREAS, on September 28, 2012, DAPs filed papers opposing the Defendants’ Joint
5 Motion to Dismiss (Dkt. No. 1384);

6 WHEREAS, on October 26, 2012, Defendants filed reply papers in support of the Motions
7 to Dismiss (Dkt. No. 1422);

8 WHEREAS, on February 14, 2013, Special Master Charles A. Legge heard argument on
9 the Motions to Dismiss;

10 WHEREAS, on February 22, 2013, DAPs filed a letter brief to Special Master Legge
11 (Dkt. No. 1580);

12 WHEREAS, on February 22, 2013, Defendants filed a letter brief to Special Master Legge
13 (Dkt. No. 1581);

14 WHEREAS, on May 2, 2013, Special Master Legge issued a Report and Recommendation
15 Regarding the Motions to Dismiss (Dkt. No. 1664) (“R&R”);

16 WHEREAS, the Motion to Dismiss and subsequent R&R cover a large number of legal
17 issues that span both DAPs’ federal claims and claims brought under the laws of 17 different
18 states;

19 WHEREAS, Defendants and DAPs (collectively “the Parties”) intend to move to adopt or
20 object to various portions of the R&R;

21 WHEREAS, the Local Rules of the United States District Court for the Northern District
22 of California, Civil Local Rules 7-2 and 7-4, would otherwise govern the page limits for the
23 opening briefs, the responsive briefs, and the reply briefs in connection with the parties’ motions
24 to adopt, and objections to, the R&R.

25 IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED by and between counsel for the DAPs
26 and counsel for the Defendants in the above-captioned actions, as follows:

27 1. The Parties’ opening briefs shall be limited to no more than 30 pages of text;

28 STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED] ORDER
REGARDING PAGE LIMITS OF OBJECTIONS
TO AND MOTIONS TO ADOPT SPECIAL
MASTER’S MAY 2, 2013 REPORT AND
RECOMMENDATION ON MOTIONS TO
DISMISS DIRECT ACTION COMPLAINTS

2. The Parties' responsive briefs shall be limited to no more than 45 pages of text;
3. The Parties' reply brief shall be limited to no more than 20 pages of text.

Dated: May 31, 2013

Respectfully submitted,

WHITE & CASE LLP

By: /s/ Lucius B. Lau
CHRISTOPHER M. CURRAN (*pro hac vice*)
ccurran@whitecase.com

LUCIUS B. LAU (*pro hac vice*)
alau@whitecase.com

DANA E. FOSTER (*pro hac vice*)
defoster@whitecase.com

WHITE & CASE LLP
701 Thirteenth Street, N.W.
Washington, DC 20005
Telephone: (202) 626-3600
Facsimile: (202) 639-9355

*Attorneys for Defendants Toshiba Corporation,
Toshiba America Information Systems, Inc., Toshiba
America Consumer Products, L.L.C., and Toshiba
America Electronic Components, Inc.*

O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP

By: /s/ Ian Simmons
IAN SIMMONS (*pro hac vice*)
isimmons@omm.com

BENJAMIN G. BRADSHAW (SBN 189925)
bbradshaw@omm.com

KEVIN D. FEDER (SBN 252347)
kfeder@omm.com

O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP
1625 Eye Street, NW
Washington, DC 20006
Telephone: (202) 383-5300
Facsimile: (202) 383-5414

*Attorneys for Defendants Samsung Electronics Co.,
Ltd. and Samsung Electronics America, Inc.*

WINSTON & STRAWN LLP

By: /s/ Jeffrey L. Kessler
JEFFREY L. KESSLER (*pro hac vice*)

JKessler@winston.com

A. PAUL VICTOR (*pro hac vice*)

PVictor@winston.com

ALDO A. BADINI (SBN 257086)

ABadini@winston.com

EVA W. COLE (*pro hac vice*)

EWCole@winston.com

MOLLY M. DONOVAN

MMDonovan@winston.com

WINSTON & STRAWN LLP

200 Park Avenue

New York, NY 10166

Telephone: (212) 294-6700

Facsimile: (212) 294-4700

STEVEN A. REISS (*pro hac vice*)

steven.reiss@weil.com

DAVID L. YOHAI (*pro hac vice*)

david.yohai@weil.com

ADAM C. HEMLOCK (*pro hac vice*)

adam.hemlock@weil.com

WEIL, GOTSHAL & MANGES LLP

767 Fifth Avenue

New York, New York 10153-0119

Telephone: (212) 310-8000

Facsimile: (212) 310-8007

Attorneys for Defendants Panasonic Corporation (f/k/a Matsushita Electric Industrial Co., Ltd.), Panasonic Corporation of North America, MT Picture Display Co., Ltd.

MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP

By: /s/ Kent M. Roger

KENT M. ROGER (SBN 95987)

kruger@morganlewis.com

MICHELLE PARK CHIU (SBN 248421)

mchiu@morganlewis.com

MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP

One Market, Spear Street Tower

San Francisco, California 94105-1126

Telephone: (415) 442-1000

Facsimile: (415) 442-1001

1 J. CLAYTON EVERETT, JR. (*pro hac vice*)
jeverett@morganlewis.com

2 SCOTT A. STEMPEL (*pro hac vice*)
sstempel@morganlewis.com

3 **MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP**

4 111 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

5 Washington, DC 20004

6 Telephone: (202) 739-3000

7 Facsimile: (202) 739-3001

8 *Attorneys for Defendants Hitachi, Ltd., Hitachi*
9 *Displays, Ltd. (n/k/a Japan Display East, Inc.), Hitachi*
10 *Asia, Ltd., Hitachi America, Ltd., and Hitachi*
11 *Electronic Devices (USA), Inc.*

12 **MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP**

13 By: /s/ Hojoon Hwang

14 HOJOON HWANG (SBN 184950)

15 Hojoon.Hwang@mto.com

16 **MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP**

17 560 Mission Street, Twenty-Seventh Floor

18 San Francisco, California 94105-2907

19 Telephone: (415) 512-4000

20 Facsimile: (415) 512-4077

21 WILLIAM D. TEMKO (SBN 098858)

22 William.Temko@mto.com

23 JONATHAN E. ALTMAN (SBN 170607)

24 Jonathan.Altman@mto.com

25 BETHANY W. KRISTOVICH (SBN 241891)

26 Bethany.Kristovich@mto.com

27 **MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP**

28 355 South Grand Avenue, Thirty-Fifth Floor

Los Angeles, CA 90071-1560

Telephone: (213) 683-9100

Facsimile: (213) 687-3702

Attorneys for Defendants LG Electronics, Inc.; LG, LG
Electronics USA, Inc.; and LG Electronics Taiwan
Taipei Co., Ltd.

SHEPPARD MULLIN RICHTER & HAMPTON

By: /s/ Gary L. Halling

GARY L. HALLING (SBN 66087)

ghalling@sheppardmullin.com

JAMES L. MCGINNIS (SBN 95788)

jmcginnis@sheppardmullin.com

MICHAEL W. SCARBOROUGH (SBN 203524)

mscarborough@sheppardmullin.com

SHEPPARD MULLIN RICHTER & HAMPTON

Four Embarcadero Center, 17th Floor

San Francisco, California 94111

Telephone: (415) 434-9100

Facsimile: (415) 434-3947

*Attorneys for Defendants Samsung SDI America, Inc.;
Samsung SDI Co., Ltd.; Samsung SDI (Malaysia) SDN.
BHD.; Samsung SDI Mexico S.A. DE C.V.; Samsung
SDI Brasil Ltda.; Shenzhen Samsung SDI Co., Ltd. and
Tianjin Samsung SDI Co., Ltd.*

BAKER BOTTS LLP

By: /s/ Jon V. Swenson

JON V. SWENSON (SBN 233054)

jon.swenson@bakerbotts.com

BAKER BOTTS LLP

1001 Page Mill Road

Building One, Suite 200

Palo Alto, CA 94304

Telephone: (650) 739-7500

Facsimile: (650) 739-7699

E-mail: jon.swenson@bakerbotts.com

JOHN M. TALADAY (*pro hac vice*)

john.taladay@bakerbotts.com

JOSEPH OSTOYICH (*pro hac vice*)

joseph.ostoyich@bakerbotts.com

BAKER BOTTS LLP

1299 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W.

Washington, DC 20004-2400

Telephone: (202) 639-7700

Facsimile: (202) 639-7890

*Attorneys for Defendants Koninklijke Philips
Electronics N.V. and Philips Electronics North
America Corporation*

GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP

By: /s/ Rachel S. Brass

Rachel S. Brass (SBN 219301)

rbrass@gibsondunn.com

Joel S. Sanders (SBN 107234)

jsanders@gibsondunn.com

Austin V. Schwing (SBN 211696)

GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP

555 Mission Street, Suite 3000

San Francisco, California 94105

Tel: (415) 393-8200

Fax: (415) 393-8306

*Attorneys for Defendant Chunghwa Picture Tubes, Ltd.
and Chunghwa Picture Tubes (Malaysia) as to the
Target Am. Compl., P.C. Richard Compl., Tweeter
Compl., CompuCom Compl., Interbond Compl., Costco
Compl., Office Depo Compl. and Best Buy Compl. only*

PERKINS COIE LLP

By: /s/ David J. Burman

DAVID J. BURMAN (*pro hac vice*)

DBurman@perkinscoie.com

CORI G. MOORE (*pro hac vice*)

CGMoore@perkinscoie.com

ERIC J. WEISS (*pro hac vice*)

EWeiss@perkinscoie.com

NICHOLAS H. HESTERBERG (*pro hac vice*)

NHesterberg@perkinscoie.com

PERKINS COIE LLP

1201 Third Avenue, Suite 4900

Seattle, WA 98101-3099

Telephone: 206.359.8000

Facsimile: 206.359.9000

JOREN BASS (Bar No. 208143)

JBass@perkinscoie.com

PERKINS COIE LLP

Four Embarcadero Center, Suite 2400

San Francisco, CA 94111-4131

Telephone: 415.344.7120

Facsimile: 415.344.7320

Attorneys for Plaintiff Costco Wholesale Corporation

BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP

By: /s/ Philip J. Iovieno

PHILIP J. IOVIENO

piovieno@bsflp.com

ANNE M. NARDACCI

anardacci@bsflp.com

BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP

10 North Pearl Street, 4th Floor

Albany, NY 12207

Telephone: (518) 434-0600

Facsimile: (518) 434-0665

WILLIAM A. ISAACSON

wisaacson@bsflp.com

JENNIFER MILICI

jmilici@bsflp.com

BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP

5301 Wisconsin Ave. NW, Suite 800

Washington, D.C. 20015

Telephone: (202) 237-2727

Facsimile: (202) 237-6131

STUART SINGER

ssinger@bsflp.com

BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP

401 East Las Olas Blvd., Suite 1200

Fort Lauderdale, FL 33301

Telephone: (954) 356-0011

Facsimile: (954) 356-0022

*Liaison Counsel for Direct Action Plaintiffs and
Attorneys for Plaintiffs Electrograph Systems, Inc.,
Electrograph Technologies, Corp., Office Depot, Inc.,
Compucom Systems, Inc., Interbond Corporation of
America, P.C. Richard & Son Long Island
Corporation, Marta Cooperative of America, Inc., ABC
Appliance, Inc., Schultze Agency Services LLC on
behalf of Tweeter Opco, LLC and Tweeter Newco, LLC*

ROBINS, KAPLAN, MILLER & CIRESI L.L.P.

By: /s/ Roman M. Silberfeld

ROMAN M. SILBERFELD (SBN 62783)

RMSilberfeld@rkmc.com

DAVID MARTINEZ (SBN 193183)

DMartinez@rkmc.com

ROBINS, KAPLAN, MILLER & CIRESI L.L.P.

2049 Century Park East, Suite 3400

Los Angeles, CA 90067-3208

Telephone: (310) 552-0130

Facsimile: (310) 229-5800

STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED] ORDER
REGARDING PAGE LIMITS OF OBJECTIONS
TO AND MOTIONS TO ADOPT SPECIAL
MASTER'S MAY 2, 2013 REPORT AND
RECOMMENDATION ON MOTIONS TO
DISMISS DIRECT ACTION COMPLAINTS

Attorneys For Plaintiffs Best Buy Co., Inc, Best Buy Purchasing LLC, Best Buy Enterprise Services, Inc., Best Buy Stores, L.P., Bestbuy.com, L.L.C., and Magnolia Hi-Fi, LLC

SUSMAN GODFREY L.L.P.

By: /s/ Kenneth S. Marks
H. LEE GODFREY
lgodfrey@sumangodfrey.com
KENNETH S. MARKS
kmarks@sumangodfrey.com
JONATHAN J. ROSS
jross@sumangodfrey.com
JOHNNY W. CARTER
jcarter@sumangodfrey.com
DAVID M. PETERSON
dpeterson@sumangodfrey.com
SUSMAN GODFREY L.L.P.
1000 Louisiana Street, Suite 5100
Houston, Texas 77002
Telephone: (713) 651-9366
Facsimile: (713) 654-6666

PARKER C. FOLSE III
pfolse@sumangodfrey.com
RACHEL S. BLACK
rblack@sumangodfrey.com
JORDAN CONNORS
jconnors@sumangodfrey.com
SUSMAN GODFREY L.L.P.
1201 Third Avenue, Suite 3800
Seattle, Washington 98101-3000
Telephone: (206) 516-3880
Facsimile: (206) 516-3883

Attorneys for Plaintiff Alfred H. Siegel, as Trustee of the Circuit City Stores, Inc. Liquidating Trust

CROWELL & MORING LLP

By: /s/ Jason C. Murray
JASON C. MURRAY (CA Bar No. 169806)
jmurray@crowell.com
CROWELL & MORING LLP
515 South Flower St., 40th Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90071
Telephone: (213) 443-5582
Facsimile: (213) 622-2690

STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED] ORDER
REGARDING PAGE LIMITS OF OBJECTIONS
TO AND MOTIONS TO ADOPT SPECIAL
MASTER'S MAY 2, 2013 REPORT AND
RECOMMENDATION ON MOTIONS TO
DISMISS DIRECT ACTION COMPLAINTS

JEROME A. MURPHY (*pro hac vice*)
jmurphy@crowell.com
ASTOR H.L. HEAVEN (*pro hac vice*)
aheaven@crowell.com
CROWELL & MORING LLP
1001 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20004
Telephone: (202) 624-2500
Facsimile: (202) 628-5116

Attorneys for Target Corp. and RadioShack Corp.

KENNY NACHWALTER, P.A.

By: /s/ Richard Alan Arnold
RICHARD ALAN ARNOLD
rarnold@knpa.com
WILLIAM J. BLECHMAN
wblechman@knpa.com
KEVIN J. MURRAY
kmurray@knpa.com
KENNY NACHWALTER, P.A.
201 S. Biscayne Blvd., Suite 1100
Miami, FL 33131
Tel: (305) 373-1000
Fax: (305) 372-1861

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs Sears, Roebuck and Co. and
Kmart Corp.*

LINDQUIST & VENNUM P.L.L.P.

By: /s/ Jessica L. Meyer
Jessica L. Meyer (SBN: 249064)
jmeyer@lindquist.com
James M. Lockhart (*pro hac vice*)
jlockhart@lindquist.com
James P. McCarthy (*pro hac vice*)
jmccarthy@lindquist.com
Kelly G. Laudon (*pro hac vice*)
klaudon@lindquist.com
LINDQUIST & VENNUM P.L.L.P.
4200 IDS Center
80 South Eighth Street
Minneapolis, MN 55402
Telephone: (612) 371-3211
Facsimile: (612) 371-3207

Attorneys for Plaintiffs John R. Stoebner, as Chapter 7

STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED] ORDER
REGARDING PAGE LIMITS OF OBJECTIONS
TO AND MOTIONS TO ADOPT SPECIAL
MASTER'S MAY 2, 2013 REPORT AND
RECOMMENDATION ON MOTIONS TO
DISMISS DIRECT ACTION COMPLAINTS

*Trustee for PBE Consumer Electronics, LLC and
Related Entities; and Douglas A. Kelley, as Chapter 11
Trustee for Petters Company, Inc. and Related Entities,
and as Receiver for Petters Company, LLC and Related
Entities*

STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED] ORDER
REGARDING PAGE LIMITS OF OBJECTIONS
TO AND MOTIONS TO ADOPT SPECIAL
MASTER'S MAY 2, 2013 REPORT AND
RECOMMENDATION ON MOTIONS TO
DISMISS DIRECT ACTION COMPLAINTS

PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: _____

Hon. Samuel Conti
United States District Judge

STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED] ORDER
REGARDING PAGE LIMITS OF OBJECTIONS
TO AND MOTIONS TO ADOPT SPECIAL
MASTER'S MAY 2, 2013 REPORT AND
RECOMMENDATION ON MOTIONS TO
DISMISS DIRECT ACTION COMPLAINTS

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

On May 31, 2013, I caused a copy of the “STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED] ORDER REGARDING PAGE LIMITS OF OBJECTIONS TO AND MOTIONS TO ADOPT SPECIAL MASTER’S MAY 2, 2013 REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION ON MOTIONS TO DISMISS DIRECT ACTION COMPLAINTS” to be electronically filed via the Court’s Electronic Case Filing System, which constitutes service in this action pursuant to the Court’s order of September 29, 2008.

By: /s/ Lucius B. Lau
Lucius B. Lau (*pro hac vice*)